

ACADEMIC SENATE MINUTES

OCTOBER 15, 2024

Nicole DeRose	President	2023-2025	Y
Elizabeth “Liz” Encarnacion	Vice-President/President-Elect	2024-2025	Y
Robin Witt	Secretary/Treasurer	2024-2025	Y
Angela Burk – Herrick	Curriculum Chair	2023-2025	Y
Joseph Lee	Business & Applied Technology	2024-2026	Y
Jonathan Polidano	Business & Applied Technology	2023-2025	Y
Hannah Carter	Chino Campus	2024-2026	Y
Robert Nazar	Chino Campus	2023-2025	Y
Sean Connelly	Fontana Campus	2024-2026	Y
Anthony Guaracha	Fontana Campus	2023-2025	Y
Jayne Clark Frize	Health Sciences	2024-2026	Y
Omar Estrada	Health Sciences	2023-2025	Y
Tara Johnson	HFIC	2023-2025	Y
Vacant	HFIC	2023-2025	
Terezita Reyes Overduin	Instructional Support	2024-2026	Y
Christina Holdiness	Instructional Support	2023-2025	N
Robert Hadaway	Kinesiology, Nutrition & Athletics	2024-2026	Y
Annette Henry	Kinesiology, Nutrition & Athletics	2023-2025	Y
Laura Santamaria Brady	Language Arts	2024-2026	N
Phatana Ith	Language Arts	2023-2025	Y
Jinny Lee	Mathematics & Science	2024-2026	Y
Robin Witt	Mathematics & Science	2023-2025	Y
Vacant	Social & Behavioral Sciences	2024-2026	
Patricia Gomez	Social & Behavioral Sciences	2023-2025	Y
Myra Andrade	Student Services	2024-2026	Y
Michelle Martinez	Student Services	2023-2025	X
Daniel Jacobo	Visual & Performing Arts	2024-2026	N
Leta Ming	Visual & Performing Arts	2023-2025	X
Sarah Chamberlain	Senator-At-Large	2024-2027	Y
Tamari Jenkins	Senator-At-Large	2023-2026	Y
Jackson Tropp	Senator-At-Large	2022-2025	Y
Jennifer Flores Moreno	Adjunct Senator-At-Large	2025-2026	X
Tina Kuo	Adjunct Senator-At-Large	2023-2025	Y
Alternates			
Jay Scott	Business & Applied Technology	2023-2025	N
Manar Hijaz	Chino Campus	2023-2025	Y
Greg Creel	Fontana Campus	2023-2025	N
Lisa Doget	Health Sciences	2023-2025	N
Vacant	HFIC	2024-2026	
Shelley Marcus	Instructional Support	2023-2025	Y
Candice Hines-Tinsley	Kinesiology, Nutrition, & Athletics	2023-2025	Y
Stephen Shelton	Language Arts	2024-2026	Y
Justin Keller	Mathematics & Science	2024-2026	Y
Louisa Villeneuve	Mathematics & Science	2024-2025	Y
Vacant	Social & Behavioral Sciences	2024-2026	
Melissa Johannsen	Student Services	2024-2026	Y
Fabiola Espitia	Student Services	2023-2025	N
Vacant	Visual & Performing Arts	2023-2025	
Vacant	Adjunct Alternate Senator	2023-2025	
Lisa Bruchet	Classified Senate Liaison	2023-2025	Y
Anthony Solomon	Chaffey College Student Government	2023-2024	Y

Guests:

Jon Ausubel, CCFA President and English, ACD
Sharon Alton, English, ACD
Sharon Awad, Curriculum Specialist, Curriculum
Tina Altis, Senior Accounting Technician, Budgeting and Fiscal Services
Jackie Boyobe, Counselor, Counseling
Lisa Bruchet, Accountant, Budgeting and Fiscal Services
Angela Cardinale, Coordinator, Distance Education
Sandra Collins, Biology, STEM
Melissa Diaz, Senior Accounting Technician, Budgeting and Fiscal Services
James Kamienski, Student, Chaffey College
Nicole Kemp, Administrative Assistant, Chaffey College Foundation
Andrew Long, Dean, School of Instructional Support
Jennifer Flores Moreno, Biology, STEM
Lissa Napoli, Administrative Assistant, Academic Senate
Rose Ann Osmanian, Instructional Specialist, Success Center
Jose Pereida, Multimedia Manager, The Breeze
Robert Stoner, Network Server Administrator, Information Technology
Mark Vidal, Director, Marketing and Public Relations
Neil Watkins, Immediate Past President, Academic Senate
Angela Ybarra, Student, Chaffey College

1. P.E. (12:30 P.M.)**2. CALL TO ORDER (12:35 P.M.)****2.1 Land Acknowledgement**

With respect and honor for the lands where Chaffey College resides and the leaders who came before us, we would like to take a moment to acknowledge the Gabrieleño-Tongva (GABRIEL-EN-YO TONG-VAH) Peoples, the original stewards of these sacred and unceded homelands. The Tongva people's history, language(s), cultural traditions, and legacy continue to shape this region and we recognize their continuing presence in their homelands.

2.2 Attendee Identification (Chino and Fontana Senators, cameras must be on and turn off all virtual backgrounds.)**3. PUBLIC COMMENT** (Reserved for Guests only and limited to two minutes.)

- President DeRose read the following statement on behalf of the Academic Senate
 - The Academic Senate, in partnership with the Classified Senate, hosted a Welcome Reception for the new hires on Wednesday, October 2, at the Faculty Success Center. We extend our gratitude to the Classified Senate for their generous donation that helped make this important event possible. Special thanks to the Faculty Success team, particularly the facilitator, Tamari Jenkins and Vicky Valle for allowing us to use their space. We also appreciate the support from classified professionals Lisa Bruchet, Deborah Corrales, Maria Jara, and Christine Phillips for assisting

with the event setup. Lastly, we want to thank Chaffey College Foundation for their donation of Pepsi-Cola products for this event.

- Melissa Diaz expressed concern for the upcoming Listening Session regarding the move of Mental Health Services to the Children's Center. In April 2023, Melissa spoke with Dr. Shannon about the Children's Center, and why it had not been reopened. Melissa states Dr. Shannon became very defensive in that conversation, and he advised her that there were certain things going on of which she was not aware. In March 2024, Melissa approached Dr. Shannon about the Children's Center again with no success. She is concerned the district will continue to move services into that building instead of having children in the Children's Center.
- Sharon Alton stated that SEPI is the Student Equity Planning Initiative at Chaffey. The initiative is through the Chancellor's Office and helps align our equity goals with guided pathways. Although there is a group at Chaffey College that is supposed to work on the equity plan, only Sharon and Amanda Admire from Institutional Research have been volunteering to attend conferences and workgroups for the last couple of years. Unfortunately, the equity plan that the Chaffey group put together has not been held to the high esteem that it deserves and hasn't been taken seriously. Sharon was told during a meeting by a member of that group who was supposed to be working on the equity plan, "I work better alone at night by myself." Our equity plan then came out, and it was underwhelming to say the least. We are not hitting our DEIA goals. There has been little change when it comes to equity. Sharon does this work because if she doesn't, it won't get done. Sharon wants to know when and how we're going to get this thing started, and how we're going to start taking the initiative and ownership of our equity plans. Sharon states this work is outside of her professional service at this point. She is no longer on guided pathways, yet she is still the only person, along with Amanda, continuing to do this work. The next iteration of the equity plan is coming in November.
- Angela Cardinle read the following statement
 - The race conversation the District's legal team has decided to open up regarding the vote of no confidence is a lot deeper than accusing two people of color from the leadership team of a well-documented history of poor performance. This poor performance has done actual harm to our diverse campus community. The work of named executive leadership on matters related to equity and inclusion has also not addressed systemic barriers and needs; the focus has largely been on performative events, with no action items or responsibilities attached and no data to support their impact on academic or completion outcomes. The College's cost-saving at the expense of our mission and erratic decision-making, as pointed out in the vote of no confidence document, have also led to sudden layoffs of many people, including many people of color, as well as a reduction in crucial services to our diverse student body, like Federal Work Study and Career Services. I would hope executive leadership would be interested in actually addressing the content of the document rather than lobbying accusations. In the spirit of cooperation, as they like to say.

4. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

- October 15, 2024
- **Motion for Approval** - Senator Chamberlain moved to adopt the agenda for 10.15.24. Senator Gomez seconded the motion. The motion was approved. 10.15.24, 18Y/0N/0A.

5. CONSENT AGENDA

5.1 Faculty representatives that have been requested to serve on these selection/hiring committees:

5.1.1 Director, Athletics

Kendyl Rizea, Head Coach- Women's Basketball
Annette Henry, Kinesiology
David Padilla, Coordinator, Athletic Performance Fitness Center

5.1.2 Director, Purchasing Services

Marlene Soto, Rad Tech, HS

5.1.3 Campus Police Officer

Kendyl Rizea, Head Coach- Women's Basketball

5.1.4 AAII, Campus Police, 475

Nicole Barbari, Psychology, PSC&S

5.2 October 8, 2024 Meeting Minutes. See attachment titled, "ACADEMIC SENATE MINUTES OCTOBER 8, 2024 DRAFT"

5.3 Curriculum is asking that the Academic Senate endorse the course modifications that are presented in the packet. See attachment titled "10-2-2024 Curriculum Endorsements"

- **Motion for Approval** - Senator Chamberlain moved to approve the 10.15.24 Consent Agenda with item 5.2 removed. Senator Overduin seconded the motion. The motion was approved. 10.8.24, 24Y/0N/0A.
- Curriculum Chair Burk-Herrick proposed that the draft version of the resolution containing track changes (strike-throughs and edits) be included with the minutes to replace the original draft of the proposed resolution in the agenda.
- The Officers received a second letter from lawyer Matthew Besmer from the Legal Firm Atkinson, Andelson, Loya, Ruud & Romo (hereafter "AALR&R") after changes to the proposed draft of the resolution had already been made.
- Since the Executive Team is using a legal firm to respond to this draft of a proposed resolution, then should the Academic Senate have legal representation as well?
- One of the challenges the Senate faces is that we are required by law to have everything we discuss, whether we are taking a position on it or not, be absolutely public. We don't have the benefit of being able to meet behind the scenes. Everything has to happen publicly due to the Brown Act.
- The Academic Senate is required by the Brown Act to conduct all discussions and decision-making publicly. There seems to be a lack of knowledge by the Executive Team of how the Senate must operate. Other than the governing board, the Academic Senate (and subcommittee) and CCSG are the only other places on campus that have this type of requirement.
- The senators discussed how to present revisions to a proposed draft of a resolution in the minutes and on the website:
 - Use track changes to show revisions made during the meeting.
 - Include a watermark labeled "DRAFT."
- The goal is to be transparent about the revision process while also making it clear that nothing is an official Senate position until voted on.

- It seems the Executive Team may not fully understand the Senate's requirements for public transparency in their work.
- Senators want to ensure the public record shows this is a draft of a proposed document and a work in progress, not the official position of the Senate or any individual Senate Officer.
- **Motion for Approval** - Curriculum Chair Burk-Herrick moved to approve the 10.8.24 minutes (item 5.2) with a track change version of the proposed draft of the resolution. Senator Shelton seconded the motion. The motion was approved. 10.8.24, 26Y/0N/0A.

6. REPORT(S)

6.1 President, see attachment titled “Academic Senate President’s Report Tuesday, October 15, 2024”

- In addition, President DeRose presented a few items from today’s President's Cabinet meeting which will be provided in a future report.
 - The Executive team originally proposed the first meeting for the MacKenzie Scott Advisory Group on October 28th but both faculty and classified have not yet identified representatives. So a postponement was requested, and the tentative date now is sometime in November. Students are still identifying their representatives as well.
 - CIO McClellan will be working with the Deans to take a fresh look at ACCs. When it was originally launched it was considered phase one. They will look at challenges associated with implementation which may require cleanup to ensure that the ACC model is effective. Dr. McClellan will work with deans, coordinators, and faculty in their areas to identify any potential hiccups that resulted from the implementation to move from schools to ACCs.
 - The college met with the DPS Director to ensure that any move made was in compliance. The college had a deadline of August 1st to make all of the changes, and then there was an evaluation done after August 1st to identify if there were any issues or areas that were still out of compliance and get those corrected. At the present time, the DPS space is compliant.
 - There has been confusion that the career services area had been operating without a director or a budget. It was stated in the President’s Cabinet meeting today that is incorrect.
 - Foundation WiFi Hotspot Scholarships are available to students so they can request Wi-fi Hotspots. Also students can check out chromebooks now which are available for checkout at the library at all 3 locations.
- Correction to President’s Report: there is a typo on the second bullet under AIG Meeting Update from the 10/4/2024 Meeting. The sentence “New locations: SSA, BEB, Beeks Sports, Center Gym, & CAA.” should read “New locations: SSA, BEB, Beeks Sports Center, Gym, & CAA.”

6.2 President-Elect - no report

6.3 Secretary/Treasurer - no report

6.4 Curriculum Chair - no report

6.5 Classified Senate Liaison - no report

6.6 Chaffey College Student Government Liaison - no report

6.7 CCFA President

- Jon Ausubel read the following statement:
 - Good afternoon Academic Senate Officers, Senators, liaisons, and others.

I stand today as President of the Chaffey College Faculty Association and its official spokesperson to speak to the vote of no confidence currently before the Academic Senate.

Earlier today I shared with the Academic Senate President a draft of the remarks I had planned to make here today; since then I have had additional thoughts which I will also share.

On behalf of the Faculty Association, I express concern that there are two serious blind spots in the resolution as it currently stands.

First, while the members of the Executive Team certainly bear some responsibility for the problems identified in the resolution, the five members of Chaffey College's Governing Board also bear responsibility for the failings the resolution calls out. The Chaffey College Governing Board approves every hire the college makes— management, faculty, staff, and students. Thus, to exclude the five members of the Chaffey College Governing Board from responsibility in the questionable hiring practices the resolution cites is to blame the hand for the action of the body that controls the hand.

Second, the desired outcomes from the resolution are unclear and need further consideration. If improved communications are desired, then talk: Faculty at Chaffey have loud voices at the President's Cabinet, at Board Agenda Review, at the Dialogues with the Board, in AIG, Labor Management, and in other forums as well. If hiring practices need improvement, then let us form a group to work on those improvements as we did with the FON workgroup.

It may well be that the outcomes sought through the vote of no confidence have already been achieved without ever taking an actual vote, and so I urge the Academic Senate to pause to clarify what it wants and to seek more efficacious ways to achieve those goals without creating the disruption a vote of no confidence would cause.

The Chaffey College Faculty Association urges the Academic Senate to consider the culpability of the five elected members of the Chaffey College Governing Board and to pause in its pursuit of a vote of no confidence to determine if there are more collegial avenues to achieving the outcomes it hopes for. Thank you.

- Several senators asked if Jon Ausubel's statement represented the opinion of the Rep Council or if it represented his own personal opinion and if there was a vote taken at Rep Council. Jon responded that, as CCFA President, he is the official spokesperson and was representing the opinions of the Rep Council including the CCFA Officers and Grievance Officers. In addition, his comments have been vetted with CCFA.
- A question was asked: since legal counsel has been engaged, using taxpayer funds, on behalf of the Executive Team, what is the union's position on defending faculty members from bullying by the Executive Team while exercising their academic rights? Jon replied that CCFA members can obtain legal representation through CTA and he will find out how unions interact with respect to votes of no confidence.
- Several senators expressed desire for CCFA support with the proposed draft of the resolution.

- If the Senate considered Jon’s suggestion in his statement, would CCFA support or take the lead? Jon replied that would have to be a matter taken up by the Rep Council.

7. GUEST(S)/PRESENTATION(S) - None.

8. UNFINISHED BUSINESS

8.1 Discussion Item: Academic Senate Proposed Resolution Vote of No Confidence for Chaffey College Superintendent/President Dr. Henry Shannon, Associate Superintendent Lisa Bailey, and Associate Superintendent Alisha Rosas. See attachment titled, “Resolution regarding a Vote of No Confidence for Chaffey College Superintendent/President Dr. Henry Shannon, Associate Superintendent Lisa Bailey, and Associate Superintendent Alisha Rosas.”

- Senators expressed concern that when one side is dealing through an attorney, it would behoove the other side to deal with the situation through an attorney as well. Not doing so may place the Senate membership in peril.
- Senators discussed the letters sent by AALR&R (see attached):
 - The draft of the proposed resolution has been updated to clearly delineate that this is the perception of the Senate.
 - A Senator noted that it was ironic that the letter from the legal firm suggested the proposed draft of the resolution targets persons of color when the Executive Team is currently being sued for a similar matter.
- Non-tenured senators from one area were concerned about potential retaliation, however their constituents requested opportunities for input. Feedback from constituents from this area was overwhelming in support of the updated draft resolution.
- The Senate feels that many opportunities have already been given to the Executive Team to discuss the issues raised in the draft of the proposed resolution.
- It was noted in reading other Community College’s votes of no confidence that their resolutions are much less detailed than our draft of the proposed resolution.
- Senators questioned if the Executive Team is using public funds to engage a legal team to protect themselves against their own faculty. Since the first letter stated the legal firm was representing the district, isn’t the Senate part of the district?
- Senators expressed their support for the Officers. Letters from AALR&R should be addressed to the entire Senate, not just the Officers. This matter is a Senate discussion, not an Officer discussion.
- What the Senate is experiencing right now is exactly what the Classified professionals have been talking about: culture of fear, bullying, and a fear of retaliation.
- Senators noted that the Executive Team had opportunities to address the concerns outlined in the proposed draft of the resolution during the public comment portion of the Senate meeting but have not done so to date. Why don’t they provide evidence for the items that are alleged to be factual inaccuracies and untrue statements in the letters from the lawyer?
- Senators expressed the need to continue this discussion at the next meeting.
- Additional Resources:
 - See Attachment Titled “Vote of No Confidence Frequently Asked Questions”
 - See attachment Faculty Senate Minutes 11/23/99 Previous Vote of No Confidence, see Attachment Titled “Faculty Senate Minutes - November 23, 1999”

- [Power of the Faculty: Consequences of No Confidence Votes for College Presidents | Journal of Research on the College President \(uark.edu\)](#)

9. NEW BUSINESS *10 minutes max per item - None.

10. FLOOR ITEMS *10 minutes max (Reserved to raise concerns within the Academic Senate scope. The Senate will hear your concerns/questions, but may not respond. If requested, the concern can be included on a future agenda.)

11. ANNOUNCEMENTS

11.1 Chaffey College Academic Senate

11.2 Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC) Information

11.2.1 Save the Date! [ASCCC's annual Fall Plenary Session](#), November 7-9, 2024. This is a hybrid event taking place at the [Visalia Convention Center](#) 303 E Acequia Ave, Visalia, CA 93291. We hope that all local faculty leaders will plan to join us in Visalia!

11.2.2 Check out Academic Senate for California Community Colleges webpage for other great webinars/events at asccc.org

11.3 Chaffey College

11.3.1 Save the Date! [Report to the Community 2024](#), Road To Student Success, Thursday, November 7, 2024. Chaffey College Chino Community Center, 5890 College Park Ave, Chino, CA 91710
11:00 AM - 1:00 PM.

12. ADJOURNMENT (1:50 P.M.)

The next Academic Senate meeting will be on Tuesday, October 22, 2024

Lissa A. Napoli, Recording Secretary

Robin Witt, Treasurer / Secretary

10-2-2024 Curriculum Endorsements

1. Mid-Cycle Update Curriculum Proposals:

[Physical Therapist Assistant Program Presentation](#) (The PTA curriculum was approved at the September 4, 2024 curriculum meeting).

ECONOMICS PACKAGE

[Economics Program Presentation](#)

There are no full-time faculty at the moment. The Curriculum Chair and the Articulation Officer in partnership with the Dean have determined that the following courses require no updates or changes for this mid-cycle review:

ECON-1	Introduction to Economics
ECON-2	Principles of Macroeconomics
ECON-4	Principles of Microeconomics
ECON-7	Economic History of the United States
ECON-8	History of Economic Ideas

Program Modifications:

Economics	AA-T
Political Economics	AA

HISTORY PACKAGE

[History Program Presentation](#)

The faculty have determined in their Mid-Cycle Update Form that the following courses require no updates or changes for their mid-cycle review:

HIST-1	World History: Pre-Civilization to 1500
HIST-10	History of Asian Civilizations II
HIST-12	Asian American History
HIST-16	Westward Movement and the Indian Wars of 1840-90
HIST-17	United States History through 1877
HIST-18	United States History from 1865
HIST-19	History of Ethnic Relations in the United States
HIST-2	World History: 1500 to Present
HIST-20	History of the United States from 1945-Present
HIST-21	The Sixties in American History
HIST-25	Women in United States History
HIST-37	California History
HIST-4	History of Slavery
HIST-40	Retrospective of World War II
HIST-5	Early Western Civilizations
HIST-50	African-American History I
HIST-51	African-American History II
HIST-6	Modern Western Civilizations
HIST-7	History of the Middle East
HIST-70	Chicanos: The Common History of Mexico and the

	US
HIST-71	Chicanos: The Chicano Minority in the United States
HIST-9	History of Asian Civilizations I
HUMAN-20	The Holocaust: History and Philosophy
HUMAN-5	Arts and Ideas of Europe: Antiquity to Renaissance
HUMAN-6	Arts and Ideas of Europe: Renaissance to Present

Program

Modifications:

History	AA-T
----------------	------

PHILOSOPHY PACKAGE

[Philosophy Program Presentation](#)

The faculty have determined in their Mid-Cycle Update Form that the following courses require no updates or changes for their mid-cycle review:

PHIL-70	Introduction to Philosophy
PHIL-71	Philosophy of Feminism
PHIL-72	Seminar in Ethics
PHIL-73	Seminar in Contemporary American Philosophy
PHIL-75	Symbolic Logic
PHIL-77	History of Ancient Philosophy
PHIL-78	History of Philosophy: Modern
PHIL-79	Philosophy of Consciousness
PHIL-80	Introduction to Religion
PHIL-81	Introduction to Eastern Philosophy
PHIL-82	Introduction to Monotheistic Religions: Judaism/Christianity/Islam

Course Modifications w/ DE:

PHIL-76	Critical Thinking
----------------	-------------------

Program Modifications:

Philosophy	AA-T
-------------------	------

POLITICAL SCIENCE PACKAGE

[Political Science Program Presentation](#)

The faculty have determined in their Mid-Cycle Update Form that the following courses require no updates or changes for their mid-cycle review:

PS-1	American Politics
PS-10	Comparative Politics
PS-2	Introduction to Political Science
PS-21	Urban Politics
PS-25	Latino Politics
PS-3	California Politics and Culture
PS-32	Law and Society
PS-4	Political Theory

PS-7	International Relations
------	-------------------------

Program Modifications:

Political Science	AA-T
-------------------	------

PSYCHOLOGY PACKAGE

[Psychology Program Presentation](#)

The faculty have determined in their Mid-Cycle Update Form that the following courses require no updates or changes for their mid-cycle review:

PSYCH-1	Introduction to Psychology
PSYCH-20	Developmental Psychology: Childhood and Adolescence
PSYCH-25	Developmental Psychology: Lifespan Development
PSYCH-41	Biological Psychology
PSYCH-5	Personal and Social Awareness
PSYCH-55	Abnormal Psychology
PSYCH-65	Social Psychology
PSYCH-80	Research Methods in Psychology
SCSCI-10	Statistics for Social Science
SCSCI-13	Introduction to Social Work
SCSCI-17	Human Sexuality

Program Modifications:

Psychology	AA-T
------------	------

SOCIOLOGY PACKAGE

[Sociology Program Presentation](#)

The faculty have determined in their Mid-Cycle Update Form that the following courses require no updates or changes for their mid-cycle review:

SOC-10	Introduction to Sociology
SOC-14	Sociology of Gender
SOC-15	Ethnic and Race Relations: U.S. and Global Perspectives
SOC-16	Marriage, Family and Relationships
SOC-17	Sociology of Crime
SOC-18	Sociology of Aging
SOC-25	Study of Mexican American and Latin American People in the United States
SOC-26	Introduction to Latin American Societies
SOC-30	Introduction to LGBTQIA+ Studies
SOC-32	Introduction to Women Studies
SOC-33	Introduction to Social Justice Studies
SOC-70	Social Problems
SOC-80	Introduction to Research Methods in Sociology

Program Modifications:

Social Justice Studies, General	AA-T
Sociology	AA-T

2. Other Curriculum Proposals:

Course Deactivations:

SCSCI-13	Introduction to Social Work
-----------------	-----------------------------

Academic Senate President's Report Tuesday October 15 2024

Follow Up to HR Recruitment and Selection Practices for Professional Expert Positions (10.8.2024 report)

- An email was sent to Susan Hardie, Executive Director of HR, on 10/3/2024 to inquire about this practice.
- Susan Hardie replied on Wednesday October 9. The response is below.
 - “As I am sure you are aware, the term “vacancy” is defined in Title 5, Section 53021. In pertinent part, vacancies do not include temporary positions (i.e., professional experts, short-term workers, apprentices, etc.). In this regard, professional experts are temporary/at-will employees hired by contracts that are normally for a period of a year or less. Consequently, temporary positions, like professional experts, do not typically have defined or traditional participants that we would normally empanel for filling permanent positions. However, if it is determined that the position should become permanent, then it becomes a vacancy and a shared governance committee is formed and the hiring procedures outlined in AP 7120 are applied.”
- [AP 7120](#) was searched any relevant sections pertaining to Professional Expert recruitment and selection. None were found.

AIG Meeting Update from the 10/4/2024 Meeting

- Telemedicine services information update: Professionals are available at all hours. Sample flyers were shared. The flyers were reviewed and updated versions will be placed in all student-used areas. Academic Senate also requested digital versions that could be shared with students directly by instructors. The Academic Senate also suggested that the deans at the Chino & Fontana campuses connect with faculty and staff to inform them of the services, to provide Q&A opportunities, and report back to the Administration.
- A draft survey to evening course students was reviewed and feedback provided. A flyer was created to provide evening hours, student services, and support programs. When you click on the maps there is an adorable water bottle icon that will provide the locations of water bottle filling stations. Six additional locations will be coming. Once those are added, the map will be updated. New locations: SSA, BEB, Beeks Sports, Center Gym, & CAA. Panther Express also has options to get ice and water, but they are only open until 4:30 pm. Panther Care has water (free, in AD).
- Minor Students – student ages should not be given out to anyone asking for the information, and do not give out information about students to other students, or anyone.
- Dean, Institutional Effectiveness – will recruit for this position (external -statewide). Coming soon, working on job description & announcement. Put on hold previously to evaluate the need of the position. This dean position will be accompanied by an EPA. No faculty will be reporting to this dean/no instructional programs will be assigned to this dean.
- Chrome Books – over 200 available Chrome Books. Can be checked out for the entire semester, available in the library for checkout. This may also be on the library website. Question: do they include a Wi Fi hotspot? No, they do not.

- Vacancy List – update to vacancy list for classified positions. CSEA and the district have been working their way through the reconciliation process of former positions that were on the books but never budgeted.
- Listening and Feedback Sessions – handout about the possible relocation for mental health services. The college will host these. The first will be about the possible relocation of Mental health services. A.S. suggested that there be a link for people to provide suggestions about what they would like to see appear as listening and feedback sessions.
- Share Point File – the Z-drive is going away. Migrating to Share Point. Eva Ramirez has established a meeting minutes/summary notes. All the committees that choose to share minutes will have the option to upload minutes at this Share Point location.
- Spring Finals – Currently, commencement and the last day of finals are on the same day. A definite date has not been set when the arena will be available for commencement. Options are either May 22 & 23 (Th & F). The arena will tell the college the date at the end of October. If it does fall on a Thursday, a solution will be worked out. Once the date confirmation is shared in October, a notification will go out to faculty.
- Academic Senate recommendation/endorsement of Math department recommendations for the future use of the east wing of the math building. The conclusion of the discussion is to allocate the work rooms and classroom space to the Math department. A possible visioning session with STEM faculty to plan for the rest of the facility.
- The list of topics provided by the Academic Senate was shared at AIG, and was well received. Academic Senate suggested that the use of town halls and/or listening sessions with the Executive Team could be a more effective way to gather and respond to faculty concerns.
- Academic Senate recommendation on the permanent CIO recruitment was given to the Executive Team for their review and consideration.
- Discussed utilizing true Town Hall opportunities for members of the college to ask questions and provide feedback.
- An email will be sent out when all restrooms have menstrual products available.

ATKINSON, ANDELSON, LOYA, RUUD & ROMO

A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

10 RIVER PARK PLACE EAST, SUITE 240
FRESNO, CALIFORNIA 93720-1534
(559) 225-6700

FAX (559) 468-0019
WWW.AALRR.COM

CERRITOS
(562) 653-3200

IRVINE
(949) 453-4260

MARIN
(628) 234-6200

PASADENA
(626) 583-8600

PLEASANTON
(925) 227-9200

RIVERSIDE
(951) 683-1122

SACRAMENTO
(916) 923-1200

SAN DIEGO
(858) 485-9526

October 14, 2024

VIA EMAIL ONLY

Nicole DeRose, President

Nicole.Derose@chaffey.edu

Elizabeth Encarnacion, Vice President

Elizabeth.encarnacion@chaffey.edu

Robin Witt, Secretary/Treasurer

Robin.witt@chaffey.edu

Angela Burk-Herrick, Curriculum Chair

Angela.burkherrick@chaffey.edu

Chaffey College Academic Senate|

5885 Haven Avenue

Rancho Cucamonga, California 91737

Re: Continued Factual Inaccuracies and Untrue Statements in the Academic Senate's Revised Resolution

Dear Academic Senate Leadership Members:

On October 7, 2024, I sent correspondence to you regarding the Chaffey College Academic Senate leadership's proposed "no confidence" resolution posted to the Academic Senate's website on October 4, 2024. The purpose of my prior correspondence was to place the Academic Senate on notice that the proposed resolution contained multiple false factual statements that have caused, and will continue to cause, irreparable harm to the District, including its employees.

After being placed on notice, I understand the Academic Senate decided not to vote on the proposed resolution at its meeting on October 8, presumably because it recognized that it contained false factual statements. While this was a step in the right direction, the Academic Senate has failed to remove the resolution from its public website and has failed to issue an apology to the District, including its employees.

Rather than take necessary corrective actions to mitigate the harm it has already caused, on October 11, the Academic Senate posted a revised resolution that continues to publish false factual statements about the District and its employees. Like the first resolution, the revised resolution is causing irreparable damage to the District, including the employees you have identified by name and title. The following are examples of some of the false statements found in the revised resolution:

Academic Senate Executive Committee Members

October 14, 2024

Page 2

- False and misleading statements of fact related to the “appointment” of individuals on the executive team, and the hiring of other employees;
- False and misleading statements about the Academic and Career Communities (ACCs);
- False and misleading statements related to the District’s compliance with the American with Disabilities Act; and
- False and misleading statements regarding the Career Center.

I would also like to point out that the Academic Senate leadership has misrepresented the 2021 work of consultants Dr. Frank Harris and Dr. Luke Wood (Climate Survey) in an apparent effort craft an untruthful narrative regarding the District and its executive team. It is my understanding that Dr. Harris has contacted the Academic Senate to clarify how the Academic Senate has misrepresented the survey’s findings.

I would be remiss if I did not highlight a couple of important observations about the actions being carried out by Academic Senate leadership. First, as the preface of the resolutions acknowledge, Dr. Shannon has been the Chaffey College President for 16 years. Yet, the Academic Senate leadership has, for whatever reason, not pursued “no confidence” actions until now, and only after Dr. Shannon has taken leave protected by law. The timing of the resolution does not appear to be accidental. Second, it is quite concerning that both proposed resolutions seem to focus mainly on disparaging and scrutinizing persons of color. In fact, it is my understanding that employees and individuals outside of Chaffey College have shared this observation.

Despite the Academic Senate leadership’s insistence on perpetuating false statements, the District and its leadership team remain committed to working cooperatively in the pursuit of a participatory governance model that best serves Chaffey College students and the community. The District acknowledges that when students are at the center of every decision, there is always an opportunity to resolve differences. If you are so inclined, the District leadership team is prepared to meet with the Academic Senate leadership to discuss and work through the matters raised in the “no confidence” resolution. The District also believes it would be productive to discuss the parties’ respective understandings of the Academic Senate’s jurisdiction as set forth in the Education Code and Title 5, and as defined by case law including *Diablo Valley Coll. Fac. Senate v. Contra Costa Cmty. Coll. Dist.* (2007) 148 Cal. App. 4th 1023, which held that certain administrative decisions are outside the Academic Senate’s jurisdiction.

///

///

///

ATKINSON, ANDELSON, LOYA, RUUD & ROMO

Academic Senate Executive Committee Members

October 14, 2024

Page 3

In the spirit of cooperation, the District requests that Academic Senate leadership withdraw its “no confidence” resolution from its agenda and instead, work with District leadership in a collaborative, student-centric manner consistent with the Education Code and Title 5.

Very truly yours,

ATKINSON, ANDELSON, LOYA, RUUD & ROMO



Matthew T. Besmer

MTB:ktg

ATKINSON, ANDELSON, LOYA, RUUD & ROMO

A PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

10 RIVER PARK PLACE EAST, SUITE 240
FRESNO, CALIFORNIA 93720-1534
(559) 225-6700

FAX (559) 468-0019
WWW.AALRR.COM

CERRITOS
(562) 653-3200

IRVINE
(949) 453-4260

MARIN
(628) 234-6200

PASADENA
(626) 583-8600

PLEASANTON
(925) 227-9200

RIVERSIDE
(951) 683-1122

SACRAMENTO
(916) 923-1200

SAN DIEGO
(858) 485-9526

October 7, 2024

VIA EMAIL ONLY

Nicole DeRose, President

Nicole.Derose@chaffey.edu

Elizabeth Encarnacion, Vice President

Elizabeth.encarnacion@chaffey.edu

Robin Witt, Secretary/Treasurer

Robin.witt@chaffey.edu

Angela Burk-Herrick, Curriculum Chair

Angela.burkherrick@chaffey.edu

Chaffey College Academic Senate|

5885 Haven Avenue

Rancho Cucamonga, California 91737

Re: Factual Inaccuracies and Untrue Statements in the Academic Senate's Proposed Resolution

Dear Academic Senate Executive Committee Members:

This firm represents the Chaffey Community College District ("District"). We are writing to address several factually inaccurate statements contained in a proposed Resolution Regarding a Vote of No Confidence for Dr. Shannon, Ms. Bailey, and Ms. Rosas that will be considered by the Chaffey College Academic Senate at its meeting on October 8, 2024 ("Proposed Resolution").

The District fully supports the Academic Senate's right to express opinions and to operate within the jurisdictional boundaries established by the Education Code and Title 5 of the California Code of Regulations. Along with these rights, however, comes the weighty responsibility of pursuing the truth in all academic and professional matters. The Proposed Resolution falls short of this responsibility.

The Proposed Resolution falsely accuses certain members of the District's leadership team (whom you identify by name) of having "ignored" the law by engaging in "systematic abuse of recruitment and hiring practices required by Title 5, section 53021." The District adamantly denies these allegations and similar false statements of fact repeated throughout the Proposed Resolution.

Academic Senate Executive Committee Members

October 7, 2024

Page 2

According to the District, the Proposed Resolution falsely accuses members of the District's leadership team of intentionally violating state laws in connection with certain hiring practices. To be clear, we have seen no evidence of any legal violations.

The District maintains that it took each of the employment actions highlighted in the Proposed Resolution, and more specifically in Appendix A, consistent with or pursuant to Title 5, section 53021 subdivisions (d)(1), (d)(3), or (d)(7). The Proposed Resolution's unsupported assertions are not true and can only be explained as being made with a reckless disregard for the truth. The District is concerned that such false statements have resulted in, or will result in, significant and irreparable damage or harm to the District, including the individuals identified in the Proposed Resolution, as well as the credibility of the Academic Senate.

The implications of these false statements extend beyond the District's decision-makers responsible for the employment actions highlighted in the Proposed Resolution. Based on our review, the Proposed Resolution contains inaccurate statements related to the employment of at least five current or former employees of the District identified by name in Appendix A. Specifically, the statements wrongly accuse these individuals of obtaining employment at the District by illegal or nefarious means. To the contrary, the District hired and employed these five individuals consistent with the authority and requirements set forth in Title 5, section 53021, subdivisions (d)(1), (d)(3), or (d)(7).

Further, the Proposed Resolution wrongly accuses three additional individuals (whom you identify by name in Appendix D) of obtaining employment through illegal or nefarious means. The Proposed Resolution's claims are false. The District hired and employed these three individuals consistent with the authority and requirements set forth in Title 5, section 53021.

The District would like to be clear that the statements in the Proposed Resolution related to the hiring and employment of these eight individuals are not true.

The District maintains that the Proposed Resolution is replete with additional misstatements of fact, and the District disagrees with virtually everything stated in it. Nevertheless, as noted above, the Academic Senate has the right to express its concerns regarding academic and professional matters in a manner it sees fit. The Academic Senate is entitled to its own opinion about District leadership and how the Senate believes the College is being run. However, the Academic Senate should know better than to engage in a reckless disregard of the truth by making false statements of fact that can only be explained as an intentional effort to damage the reputation of the District and educational professionals.

///

///

ATKINSON, ANDELSON, LOYA, RUUD & ROMO

Academic Senate Executive Committee Members

October 7, 2024

Page 3

We expect the Academic Senate will immediately correct and remove all false and inaccurate statements from the Proposed Resolution before it causes further significant and irreparable damage and harm to the District, including the individuals identified in the Proposed Resolution.

Very truly yours,

ATKINSON, ANDELSON, LOYA, RUUD & ROMO

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'MTB', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Matthew T. Besmer

MTB:sah

		Present	Adoption of the 10.15.24 Agenda	Approval of Consent Agenda 10.15.24 without 5.2	Meeting Minutes Amended to include Draft of Vote of No Confidence with track changes to replace original document.	
<i>Alternate Senators Italicized</i>						
Representation	Name					
President	Nicole DeRose	Y				
Vice President	Elizabeth "Liz" Encarnacion	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Secretary/Treasurer	Robin Witt	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Curriculum Chair	Angela Burk-Herrick	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Business & Applied Technology	Joseph Lee	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Business & Applied Technology	Jonathan Polidano	Y	Y	Y	Y	
<i>Business & Applied Technology Alternate</i>	<i>Jay Scott</i>	N				
Chino Campus	Hannah Carter	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Chino Campus	Robert Nazar	Y	Y	Y	Y	
<i>Chino Campus Alternate</i>	<i>Manar Hijaz</i>	Y				
Fontana Campus	Sean Connelly	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Fontana Campus	Anthony "Tony" Guaracha	Y	Y	Y	Y	
<i>Fontana Campus Alternate</i>	<i>Greg Creel</i>	N				
Health Sciences	Jayne Clark Frize	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Health Sciences	Omar Estrada	Y	Y	Y	Y	
<i>*Health Sciences Alternate</i>	<i>Lisa Doget</i>	N				
HFIC	Tara Johnson	Y	Y	Y	Y	
HFIC	Vacant					
<i>HFIC Alternate</i>	<i>Vacant</i>					
Instructional Support	Terezita Overduin	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Instructional Support	Christina Holdiness	N				
<i>Instructional Support Alternate</i>	<i>Shelley Marcus</i>	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Kinesiology, Nutrition, & Athletics	Robert Hadaway	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Kinesiology, Nutrition, & Athletics	Annette Henry	Y	Y	Y	Y	
<i>Kinesiology, Nutrition, & Athletics Alternate</i>	<i>Candice Hines-Tinsley</i>	Y				
Language Arts	Laura Santamaria Brady	N				
Language Arts	Phatana Ith	Y			Y	
<i>*Language Arts Alternate</i>	<i>Stephen Shelton</i>	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Mathematics & Science	Jinny Lee	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Mathematics & Science	Robin Witt					
<i>Mathematics & Science Alternate</i>	<i>Justin Keller</i>	Y				
<i>Mathematics & Science Alternate</i>	<i>Louisa Villeneuve</i>	Y				
Social & Behavioral Sciences	Vacant					
Social & Behavioral Sciences	Patricia Gomez	Y		Y	Y	
<i>*Social & Behavioral Sciences Alternate</i>	<i>Vacant</i>					
Student Services	Myra Andrade	Y		Y	Y	
Student Services	Michelle Martinez					
<i>* Student Services Alternate</i>	<i>Melissa Johansen</i>	Y		Y	Y	
<i>* Student Services Alternate</i>	<i>Fabiola Espitia</i>	N				
Visual and Performing Arts	Daniel Jacobo	Y				
Visual and Performing Arts	Leta Ming					
<i>*Visual and Performing Arts Alternate</i>	<i>Vacant</i>					
Senator-At-Large	Sarah Chamberlain	Y		Y	Y	
Senator-At-Large	Tamari Jenkins	Y		Y	Y	
Senator-At-Large	Jackson Tropp	Y			Y	
Adjunct Senator-at-Large	Jennifer Flores Moreno (SP'25)					
Adjunct Senator-at-Large	Tina Kuo	Y		Y	Y	
<i>*Adjunct Alternate Senator</i>	<i>Vacant</i>					
Classified Senate Liaison	Lisa Bruchet	Y				
Chaffey College Student Government	Anthony Soliman	Y				
RED indicates reported absence	PURPLE indicates reported tardy/leave early					
Total Yes Votes		34	18	24	26	0
Total No Votes			0	0	0	0
Total Abstentions			0	0	0	0
- = Not available during meeting to vote						
41 members total - up to 28 voting at any given time. The President is a non-voting member, but counts as quorum. Curriculum Chair now vote						
President ONLY votes to break a tie. Jennifer Flores Martinez Membership is not counted till Spring 2025						
A quorum shall consist of two-thirds of the voting members of the Academic Senate						
19 members are needed for QUORUM						
54 Present at this meeting = 34 members, 20 visitors						
10.15.24 Academic Senate Meeting						